



Mayor Mark Farrell
Phil Ginsburg, General Manager

Date: June 6, 2018

To: Recreation and Park Commission
Capital Committee

Through: Philip A. Ginsburg, General Manager
Dawn Kamalanathan, Director, Capital & Planning Division

From: Yael Golan, Planner, Capital & Planning Division

Subject: 858 Stanyan Street, Evaluation of Shadow on Golden Gate Park

Agenda Wording

Discussion and possible action to adopt a resolution recommending to the Planning Commission regarding whether or not the new shadow cast by the proposed project at 858 Stanyan Street will have a significant adverse impact on the use of Golden Gate Park, pursuant to Planning Code Section 295 (the Sunlight Ordinance).

Strategic Plan

The Recreation and Parks review of the shadow cast by this project supports the following objective in the Strategic Plan:

- Objective 1.2 - Strengthen the quality of existing parks and facilities.

Background

Planning Code Section 295 was adopted in 1985 in response to voter-approved Proposition K, which required Planning Commission disapproval of any structure greater than 40 feet in height that cast a shadow on property under the jurisdiction of the Recreation and Park Department, unless the Planning Commission found the shadow would not be significant. In 1989, the Recreation and Park Commission and Planning Commission jointly adopted a memorandum (the "1989 Memo") which identified quantitative and qualitative criteria for determinations of significant shadows in parks under the jurisdiction of the Recreation and Park Department. (Planning Commission Resolution No. 11595) See **Attachment A** for an overview on the quantitative and qualitative criteria.

Project Description

The project site is located at 858 Stanyan Street, on the northeastern corner of Stanyan and Frederick Streets in the Haight Ashbury neighborhood. See **Attachment B** for a Project Location Map. The project



site consists of Assessor's Block 1262, Lot 021, currently occupied by a 2,650-sq. ft. single-story commercial/residential building.

The 858 Stanyan Street Project ("Project") proposes to turn the existing single-story commercial-retail building into a new, five-story mixed-use residential over commercial-retail building. The new building would be 50 feet tall plus a 3.6-foot parapet, for a total structure height of 53.6 feet above street level. The project would include 3 residential units, 908 square feet of ground floor commercial/retail space and a 1,184-sq. ft. parking garage. See **Attachment C** for Proposed Project Images.

Surrounding Properties and Neighborhood

Haight-Ashbury is a mixed-use neighborhood, characterized by a variety of commercial, retail, public and residential uses, as well as its proximity to Golden Gate Park. Haight Street is an important Neighborhood Commercial District in the area. Haight-Ashbury is also an important tourist destination due to its unique atmosphere, shopping opportunities and proximity to Golden Gate Park.

The Project would be located within the Haight Ashbury Neighborhood Commercial and Residential District. The area immediately surrounding the Project is comprised of Golden Gate Park, residential and commercial development. Most parcels surrounding Golden Gate Park have a height limit of 40-55 feet, and existing structures are generally two to three stories tall. Taller nearby structures include some three- and four-story residential and commercial buildings on Stanyan and Frederick streets.

Parks Description and Use

Golden Gate Park

Golden Gate Park (Assessor's Block 1700 / Lot 001) is the largest public park in San Francisco under the jurisdiction of RPD. It is a 1,026.83-acre (44,728,912 sq. ft.) park located between the Haight Ashbury, Sunset, and Richmond neighborhoods. The park spans east-west between Fulton Street to the north, Stanyan Street to the east, Lincoln Way to the South, and Great Highway and Ocean Beach to the west.

Golden Gate Park contains a wide variety of natural, cultural and historic features and places, including gardens, playgrounds, picnic groves, water bodies, trails, monuments and cultural venues.

Analysis of Project Impact on Surrounding Parks

The proposed project would result in new shadows falling on the park, adding approximately 695,173 annual square foot hours (sfh) of shadow and increasing shadow load by 0.0004% above current levels, resulting in an increase in the approximated annual total shading from 0.1306%¹ to 0.1310%. The new shadow resulting from the Project would not affect any recreational uses and would fall on a surface parking lot in the south-eastern corner of the park, bounded by the Kezar Pavilion to the north, the Park

¹ Note: A typical shadow analysis would calculate the existing amount of shadow cast on the park ("current conditions"). However, due to Golden Gate Park's extremely large area, determining current shading conditions would be an unusually complicated and laborious task. Therefore, the Shadow Consultant in consultation with RPD and Planning Department staff modified the standard methodology to identify current conditions, and the existing shadow load was extrapolated based on existing shadow at Jefferson Square Park. Based on this extrapolation, approximate existing annual shadow load is 0.1306% of the total Theoretical Annual Available Sunlight (TAAS), with a 0.06% margin of error.

Aid Station building to the east, Kezar Stadium to the west and a private bicycle store to the south. See **Attachment D** for a park diagram of Golden Gate Park and images of existing conditions at the location of new shadow, and **Attachment E** for Prevision Design’s full Shadow Analysis.

The Shadow Analysis concluded the following quantitative and qualitative findings.

Quantitative Summary of Shadow Findings		
Park Size: 1026.83 acre or 44,728,912 sf		
	Square Foot Hours	Percentage
Theoretical Annual Available Sunlight (TAAS)	166,454,174,148	100%
Approximated Existing Shadow (+/- 0.06% Margin of Error)	217,422,029	0.1306%
New Project Shadow	695,173	0.0004%
Approximated Total Shadow with Proposed Project	218,117,202	0.1310%
Qualitative Summary of Shadow Findings		
 <p>Maximum Net New Shadow from Project (February 15/October 25 at 7:30am)</p>	Time of Day	Early to mid-mornings, gone by 10:00 am
	Time of Year	365 days annually
	Duration of Shadow	Average daily duration: 104 minutes Maximum daily duration: 127 minutes
	Range in Size of New Shadow	Zero to 4,423 sf (average size: 1,225 sf)
	Day and Time of Maximum New Shadow (in sf)	February 15/October 25, at 7:30am
	Day of Maximum New Shading (sfh)	February 15, October 25
	Size in sf	On February 15/October 25, max shadow size would be 4,423 sf, (0.0099% of park area)
	Location of Shadow	Southeast corner of the park on an area currently serving as a parking lot.

See **Attachment F** for a diagram of the Maximum Net New Shadow Coverage, **Attachment G** for the Full Year Aggregated Annual Net New Shadow; and **Attachment H** for the Location of Shadow Throughout the Year.

Cumulative Shading Analysis

No other projects were identified in the vicinity of the development at 858 Stanyan Street.

Project Alternative

The existing one-story building currently casts shadow on Golden Gate Park, and any additional height increase along the western half of the project site would result in added net new shadow. An addition of one story only on the eastern half of the project site would avoid casting any new shadows on the park and would result in the loss of two of the three proposed units and a significant reduction in size of the third unit.

Reducing the height of the building by 10 feet would exempt the project from Section 295 requirements but would still cast net new shadow on Golden Gate Park while resulting in the loss of one story and a significant reduction in the size of the largest proposed unit.

Project-Related Public Good

The Project sponsor identified the following benefits related to the project:

- Provide three new residential units, while maintaining an existing neighborhood commercial use
- Additional landscaping with four additional street trees
- Pay citywide Impact Fees

Project Outreach

The Project sponsor held one pre-application community meeting on May 3, 2017, attended by 7 neighborhood residents, including the chair of the Haight Neighborhood Merchant Association. Topics discussed at the meeting included Project design, safety measures at the intersection to the west of the Project and the possibility of Project sponsor participating in funding for a parklet nearby. There was no discussion of the shadow impacts the proposed Project would have on Golden Gate Park.

Environmental Review

The 858 Stanyan Street project is subject to environmental review and approval under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). On April 2, 2018, the project received a Categorical Exemption under CEQA. The Categorical Exemption Determination can be found on this link: <https://sfplanninggis.org/planningdocs/?RecordID=2017-006454ENV&RecordName=858%20Stanyan%20Street>

Staff Recommendation

Making a finding on a shadow impact on a park from a proposed development project is a policy decision for the Commission; as such, staff does not have a recommendation.

Supported By:

No support letters were received by the Planning Department.

Opposed By:

No opposition letters were received by the Planning Department.

Attachments:

- A. Section 295 Background and 1989 Memo Overview
- B. Project Location Map
- C. Proposed Project Images
- D. Golden Gate Park Diagram
- E. Prevision Shadow Analysis (Parts 1 and 2)
- F. Max Shadow Coverage
- G. Full Year Aggregate New Shadow
- H. Location of Shadow Throughout Year
- I. Draft Resolution