

Restroom Taskforce Restroom Report July 27, 2009



From the top: Restrooms at Sunnyside Playground, Angelo J. Rossi Playground (Annex), Dupont Tennis Courts, and Lower Great Highway near Judah St.

Table of Contents

Section	Page No.
Restroom Taskforce Introduction and Background	3
Restroom Taskforce Recommendations	
1) Capital Restroom Program Recommendations	6
2) Maintenance Recommendations	10

Appendices

- Appendix A: Restroom Location Summary Chart
- Appendix B: Restroom Fact Sheets and Site Maps
- Appendix C: Restroom Taskforce Meeting Minutes
- Appendix D: Restroom Prototype and Standards
- Appendix E: Map of the Taskforce's Recommendations
- Appendix F: Bond Report Restroom Program Description Page
- Appendix G: Report from Previous 2006-2007 Restroom Taskforce
- Appendix H: Maintenance Analysis Chart
- Appendix I: New Restroom Online Survey and Survey Results
- Appendix J: Capital Project Grouping Implementation Recommendations



Alta Plaza Restrooms



Balboa Park East

Restroom Taskforce Introduction and Background

The Requirements of the Clean and Safe Neighborhood Parks Bond

A critical component of the Clean and Safe Neighborhood Parks Bond is a \$11.4 million program for repair and reconstruction of freestanding restrooms in our neighborhood parks. As per the Bond Report, the Recreation & Park Commission is required to appoint a Restroom Taskforce to work with staff and the community to develop a report including:

1. A prioritized list of restrooms that need upgrades, replacements or new restrooms
2. Maintenance recommendations for their upkeep

This is that report.

The Recreation & Park Department’s Commission will review and approve the project list before bond funds are issued for this program. This taskforce’s work is very specific, focusing on making recommendations for the renovation of freestanding restrooms in our neighborhood parks.

The Park Intercept Survey conducted by the City’s Controller’s Office found the top two “Park Elements in Need of Improvement According to Survey Respondents” concerned: 1) restroom availability and 2) restroom condition (p. 17). This new restroom taskforce understands the importance of this program to the quality of life for San Francisco’s park users. Restroom location not only determines how long people can stay at a park, but also how it can be used. Presence or absence of a restroom and it’s condition leaves a lasting of impression on park users.

Taskforce membership

The following is a list of the taskforce membership as approved by the Recreation and Park Commission.

Recreation and Parks Department Operations - Manager	Steven Cismowski, NSA Manager
Recreation and Parks Department Operations-Custodial	Cliff Hsiong, Custodial Supervisor
Recreation and Parks Department-Planning	Karen Mauney-Brodek, Planner
Recreation and Parks Department-Capital	Marvin Yee, Project Manager
Park, Recreation and Open Space Advisory Committee (PROSAC)	Frank Triska, Member
Recreation and Parks Department-Structural Maintenance	Steve Flannery, Superintendent of Structural Maintenance
Neighborhood Parks Council	Meredith Thomas, Deputy Director

Meeting Dates

The restroom taskforce held public-noticed meetings in the Recreation and Parks Commission Room in the Recreation and Parks Lodge Building at 501 Stanyan Street. Meetings started at 4pm on the following eight dates:

January 21, 2009
January 28, 2009*
February 18, 2009
March 18, 2009
April 1, 2009
May 1, 2009
June 12, 2009
July 27, 2009

*This meeting began at 1pm in order to allow for site visits.

Meeting notices were posted with the San Francisco Public Library and materials for all taskforce meetings were posted online on the Department's website. Meeting minutes are included in Appendix C of this report.

Taskforce Process

The taskforce, over eight meetings, reviewed the status of all of the existing freestanding restrooms in neighborhood parks. The taskforce reviewed 1) open restrooms in active use and 2) old restroom structures closed for many years. Amongst the open sites, ten have been built or renovated in the last several years and the taskforce identifies no priority for additional improvements. (See Appendix A for details.)

Criteria and Other Considerations

The taskforce developed a set of criteria and questions to assist in prioritizing restrooms improvements in the bond program. Criteria developed by the taskforce included usage, the presence of multiple nearby park facilities, and the lack of other nearby public restrooms. The taskforce also considered security or safety issues related to existing locations of some restrooms and community requests. (See Appendix A for more detail.)

Survey for New Restroom Locations

After reviewing the existing restrooms and discussing recommendations to renovate and reopen select sites, it was determined by the taskforce that some funds would likely be available for additional new restroom locations. An online survey was developed and distributed to the public to provide feedback for desired new restroom locations. The survey asked questions related to location, need and possible security concerns. The taskforce reviewed the survey results and developed a proposal for new restrooms based on the main recommended locations for new freestanding restrooms. (See Appendix I for more detail).

History and Other Helpful Information provided by the 2006-2007 Restroom Taskforce

In 2006, the *San Francisco Recreation and Parks Restroom Task Force* composed of department staff and some of our most involved stakeholders, convened to focus on our restrooms. From Fall 2006 through December 2007, the group met to research, discuss and develop best practices for public restroom maintenance, repair, and replacement. Their findings and recommendations (including design standards) were informative for the work of this new taskforce and are included in Appendix G.

Restroom Taskforce Recommendations

Capital Restroom Program Recommendations

Project List

The taskforce developed three priority levels for restroom renovations and replacement. They are listed below.

Priority One

Repair/Renovate/Replace Currently Open Freestanding Restrooms

Alamo Square Restrooms*
Angelo J. Rossi Restrooms*
Balboa Park East Restrooms**
Bayview Playground Restrooms
Carl Larsen Park Restrooms
Dupont Tennis Courts Restrooms
Hilltop Park Restrooms
Lincoln Park
Lower Great Highway at Judah Street Restrooms
Lower Great Highway at Taraval Street Restrooms
Marina Green East Restrooms
Marina Green West Restrooms
McLaren Park – Yosemite Marsh (Oxford and Beacon) Restrooms
Mountain Lake Park Restrooms
Parkside Square Restrooms
Portsmouth Square Restrooms
State Street Restrooms
Washington Square*

Repair/Renovate/Replace Currently Closed Freestanding Restrooms- Restrooms to be Opened

Buena Vista Park Restrooms*
Michelangelo Park Restrooms
Noe Valley Courts Restrooms

Priority Two

New Freestanding Restrooms Locations

Franklin Square*
Potrero Del Sol Park*

Priority Three

New Freestanding Restrooms Locations

- 1)Walter Haas Playground*
- 2)India Basin Shoreline Park*
- 3)Precita Park*
- 4)Crocker Amazon Playground*
- 5)Bernal Hill*
- 6)McCoppin (to be coordinated with Bond capital program)

It is possible that funds will not allow for all four of the restrooms in Priority Three to be accomplished. The Taskforce reviewed the number of park facilities at each site including playgrounds, sports courts, picnic or other passive areas, dog play areas and have developed the above numbered prioritization within priority three. Those parks with the most facilities and the presence of a playground are given greatest priority.

*possible new restroom location to be reviewed and discussed through a public community process on these sites.

** coordinate with Trust for Public Land's future improvements.

Other Capital Recommendations for Incorporation into the Restroom Program

Automatic Door Unlocking Mechanisms

In keeping with the Department's recent initiative to install timers and standardize opening and closing of recreation centers, the restroom taskforce also recommends incorporating timers that would allow the automatic opening of restrooms. Due to security concerns, it is possible that some restrooms cannot be opened unsupervised. Operations staff would like to inspect certain restrooms before opening to insure that nothing occurred overnight to impact their use the following day. However, sites which could be opened automatically would provide more efficient use of custodial time. The RPD Commission has authorized \$50,000 dollars for this use. Capital will use these funds at the first few locations and evaluate their use with operations staff once installed.

Design Standards

In addition to the Design Standards developed by the 2006-2007 Restroom Taskforce (Appendix D) and the basic design employed in the recent installation of a new freestanding restroom at Victoria Manalo Draves Park, the following items should be added, adjusted, removed and considered in the future restroom renovations, replacements and additions:

Need to Add:

- Graffiti-proof grout
- Custodial sink (low mop sink)
- Storage space divided by staff use
- Eye wash station

Need to Adjust:

- Minimize grout to minimize areas of residual graffiti
- Gate doors need to lock open flush to wall and be designed to work with automatic door openers
- Seal Coat/Floor Improvement
- Exterior Restroom paint color to match RPD standard for ease in repainting for graffiti removal

Need to Remove:

- Screen on windows is unnecessary as restroom is already open via gate

Other Items to Consider:

- Site placement for best visibility and security
- Explore solar tube for lighting
- In locations were possible explore phone service for staff communication
- Possibly extend tile to top of interior walls
- Possible addition of "San Francisco" or other local-themed emblem made of tile or other material on the restroom's exterior

Signage At Restroom Locations

Clear signage has been lacking at many restroom locations. By providing the public with information, they can plan accordingly. All restroom projects under this program should include new signage within the project. Signage should be in multiple languages where appropriate. Signage should clearly display hours the restroom is open each week. In addition, if there are multiple restroom locations at a given site, signage should be provided to direct people to the nearest open restroom in case one is not available.

Green Building Practices

Green building practices compatible with LEED principles shall be incorporated into the design of restroom structures where feasible. Green building practices include water conservation, energy efficiency, waste reduction and utilizing local resources.

Cost / Flexibility of Construction Options

Based on analysis provided by Capital Division, the Taskforce would like to recommend cost-efficient project methods. Both pre-fab and "stick-built" options have roughly equivalent cost. However, "stick-built" or site built options may allow for more local competition resulting in more competitive pricing. Therefore, the restroom taskforce recommends using either option, allowing for the most competitive prices in order to accomplish as much as possible.

Consider possible revenue opportunities

The Restroom Taskforce is cognizant of the city's considerable budgetary constraints. Providing a cafe or other park-user serving concession at a site where restroom renovations occur could provide additional restroom supervision or upkeep which would be helpful to the success of a park restroom and bring additional revenue to the department. Capital should explore that possibility during the community process at sites that might be appropriate for this use.

Implementation / Community Feedback on Locations

The task force recommends that project timelines are planned to demonstrate (1) immediate visible benefits and (2) a steady flow of

completed projects. In addition, the taskforce recommends grouping sites, possibly geographically or by renovation type, if it provides additional cost savings. For sites that will be renovated in the existing location, the taskforce suggests basic signage notifying local residents that a restroom renovation is being planned and provide contact information. Those sites needing location relocation or those that would receive a new restroom (see "Project List" section of this report for those locations), community meetings and a more extensive outreach process will be required in order to discuss and determine the best location for a new restroom.

Other Recommendations – Possible Use of JC Decaux Freestanding Restrooms

The Restroom Taskforce recommends that the Department explore the possibilities of using JC Decaux Freestanding Restrooms at new restroom locations where appropriate. This may be a good option for site which do not have a restroom now and the public does not expect a full restroom building.

Maintenance Recommendations

Maintenance Review and Staff Analysis

Overview: The Restroom Taskforce’s role in helping to guide the implementation of the Clean and Safe Neighborhood Parks Bond Restroom Program includes the analysis of potential maintenance impacts of renovations. The taskforce also developed basic maintenance strategies to ensure that new facilities will be maintained to meet Prop C standards set by the City’s Controllers Office. Design standards and recommendations discussed previously in RPD’s *Action Plan for Bathrooms* (part of RPD’s Operations Planning 2002), *Draft Planning and Design Standards for Stand-Alone Restrooms (9-4-07)* (see Appendix D and Appendix G), and current design standards developed collaboratively by RPD Capital Division to guide the implementation of the Clean and Safe Neighborhood Parks Bond, all serve to facilitate maintenance tasks directed at meeting Prop C maintenance standards.

Prop C standards measure facility cleanliness, appearance, presence and functionality of fixtures, odor, signage and waste management. Each of these functional items measured by Prop C has corresponding design criteria to help meet the maintenance goals and is detailed in the attachments previously mentioned. Below is a summary of design considerations needed for successful compliance.

	Key design elements	Key maintenance resources
Cleanliness	Smooth, non-slip surfaces that are durable, easily sanitized, replaceable, and graffiti resistant. Water source for power washing and mop sink, preferably with hot water. Adequate storage for cleaning supplies, chemicals, mops, brooms, waste collection. On properly installed surfaces power washing will facilitate more efficient cleaning than mopping saving custodial effort.	M&S budget sufficient for supplies, chemicals, tools, power-washer, waste management collection, electricity, labor for clearing floor drains. Custodial service schedule will vary upon site usage, demand and abuse. A minimum of twice daily cleaning is recommended.
Appearance	Smooth, non-slip surfaces that are durable, easily sanitized, replaceable, and graffiti resistant. Painted exterior surfaces recommended. Entry areas without nooks that collect debris, dirt and garbage. Positive drainage away from buildings to facilitate cleaning. Areas to collect waste. External water source for power washing. Storage adequate for tools, equipment, hoses, chemicals.	Hoses, sufficient budget for repainting, as needed, to meet city mandated 48 hour graffiti removal policy, labor for clearing catch basins. Custodial service schedule will vary upon site usage, demand and abuse, but minimum twice daily cleaning.

Functionality of Equipment	Water conserving toilets, urinals, sinks that are easily replaceable; vandal resistant soap dispenser, hand dryer, toilet seat cover dispenser, grab bar, toilet paper dispenser (dual jumbo junior roll preferred); lighting; signage indicating gender on both sides of doors/gates and/or on wall at entry; storage for replacement supplies. Wall mounted toilets and fixtures also promote efficient cleaning.	M&S budget sufficient for toilet paper, soap, toilet seat covers. Availability of proper storage will minimize staff time for transport of supplies and vehicle for transport. Custodial service schedule will vary upon site usage, demand and abuse, but minimum twice daily re-stocking.
Odor	Ventilation. Non-porous surfaces treated with impregnating sealer. Open entry gates (not doors) and open louvered windows (without glass) provide ventilation.	Adequate air circulation enables custodial service to better manage odor.
Waste Management	Waste collection areas large enough to meet need assuming twice daily service.	Custodial service schedule will vary upon site usage, demand and abuse, but minimum twice daily waste collection. Storage for compostable waste.

Additionally, renovation/replacement and new restroom construction provides opportunities to mitigate inefficiencies related to greater park maintenance such as storage of landscape and custodial equipment, telecommunications, infrastructure housing, etc. While it is anticipated that in general, modern facilities will be more efficiently maintained, it is also assumed that renovated/replaced facilities will have increased usage. That, coupled with new facilities, will increase overall maintenance obligations city-wide.

MAINTENANCE IMPACTS AND BENEFITS - CURRENT SITES FOR RENOVATION AND REPLACEMENT

The analysis of potential sites for renovation/replacement yielded the following results (see attachment for detailed info):

- Overall, 23 sites are being examined for renovation, including 3 that are currently permanently closed
- Renovation/Replacement of these facilities is anticipated to result in a total of 271 additional hours/week of restroom availability, city-wide
- Based on staff interviews, the projected additional staff required to meet Prop C maintenance standards is 2.05 FTE, city-wide
- Of the 20 existing and open restroom facilities, 10 sites will result in no anticipated change in operating hours or staffing requirements
- The remaining currently open sites (10) have in a projected net increased staffing requirement of 0.73 FTE with a net increase in available hours of 65 hours

- The largest increase in available restroom hours/week (206 hours) and the largest staffing increase (1.32 FTE) come from opening sites that are currently closed.

MAINTENANCE IMPACTS AND BENEFITS - NEW RESTROOM SITES

A recent online restroom survey identified six additional sites for potential new restroom construction – Bernal Hill, Franklin Square, India Basin Shoreline Park, Potrero Del Sol, Precita Park, and Walter Haas Playground. Analysis of these potential sites yielded the following results (see attachment for detailed info):

- Installation of these facilities is anticipated to result in a total of 494 additional hours/week of restroom availability city-wide
- Based on staff interviews, the projected additional staff required to meet Prop C maintenance standards in these six new facilities is 2.03 FTE city-wide

TOTAL PROGRAM IMPACTS AND BENEFITS

Total staff impacts for implementation of the complete restroom program, (assuming all of the new sites are built) is

- Total additional projected weekly availability equals 765 hours city-wide
- Total projected additional staff required to meet maintenance standards is 4.08 FTE city-wide

Requiring Clear Hours of Operation Signage At All Restroom Locations

Clear signage has been lacking at many restroom locations. By providing the public with information, they can plan accordingly. All operating restrooms should have signage clearly displaying hours the restroom is open each week. In addition, if there are multiple restroom locations at a given site, signage should be provided to direct people to the nearest open restrooms in case one is not available.

Restroom Recommendations for Structural Maintenance

Restrooms at sites where restrooms are inside a clubhouse or recreation center, should be reviewed, if possible to provide access from the exterior of the facility. Some sites have existing exterior doors which connect to the restroom facilities, but have not been used and may need repair. Due to recent budget cuts, there are sites where the clubhouse or recreation center is not open, but the restroom could be. Structural Maintenance should investigate and improve exterior access to restrooms in this configuration where possible. Restrooms for consideration include Potrero Hill Recreation Center and St. Mary's Recreation Center.